

IN THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

18-662C&E CAB

STATE OF HAWAII

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,	)	DOCKET NO. 16-CA-EO-12
STATE OF HAWAII,	)	
	)	
Complainant,	)	
	)	
vs.	)	
	)	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
HAWAIIAN ELECTRIC COMPANY, INC.,	)	
	)	
Respondent	)	
	)	

---

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I served the documents listed herein by mailing, via certified mail, return receipt requested (#7018 0040 0000 8040 5623), on this date, a copy of the following documents to the person named below at the address indicated.


DOCUMENTS:

1. Notice and Finding of Violation
2. Order

PERSON SERVED AND ADDRESS:

Mr. Lawrence G. Ornellas  
 Manager, Generation  
 Hawaiian Electric Company, Inc.  
 P.O. Box 2750  
 Honolulu, Hawaii 96840-0001

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, OCT 22 2018

  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 MARIANNE ROSSIO, P.E.  
 Manager, Clean Air Branch

c: Deputy Attorney General, State of Hawaii  
 U.S. EPA, Region IX, Air & TRI Section (Enf 2-1), Enforcement Division

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the attached copies are correct  
copies of the following documents:

1. Notice and Finding of Violation and Order in  
Docket No. 16-CA-EO-12, and
2. Certificate of Service,

and that with respect to the above-described documents, I am  
authorized to make this certification.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, \_\_\_\_\_

OCT 22 2018

ATTEST:



\_\_\_\_\_  
MARIANNE ROSSIO, P.E.  
Manager, Clean Air Branch

**STATE OF HAWAII  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
CLEAN AIR BRANCH  
NOTICE AND FINDING OF VIOLATION**

<b>TO:</b>  Hawaiian Electric Company, Inc. Box 2750 Honolulu, Hawaii 96840-0001  <p style="text-align: center;">RESPONDENT</p>	<b>NOVO No. 16-CA-EO-12</b> <i>(Please write this NOVO number on all correspondence)</i>  <b>Re:</b> Covered Source Permit (CSP) Nos. 0239-01-C and 0240-01-C  <b>Property/Facility:</b> Waiuu Generating Station (CSP No. 0239-01-C) Kahe Generating Station (CSP No. 0240-01-C)
---	---

Under Hawaii Revised Statutes ("HRS"), §342B-11, Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") §11-60.1-2, and CSP Nos. 0239-01-C and 0240-01-C, the Department of Health, Clean Air Branch ("DOH"), issues this Notice and Finding of Violation and Order ("NOVO"). Based on records reviews of reports submitted to the DOH by the RESPONDENT, the DOH finds the following violation(s) alleged below. This case deals only with the violations alleged below, and the DOH may bring other cases for other violations. This case does not limit cases by any other public agency or private party.

<b>Statutes/Rules</b>	HRS, §342B-11, HAR §11-60.1-2, and CSP Nos. 0239-01-C and 0240-01-C.
-----------------------	--

<b>Nature of the Violation</b>	<p>1) <u>Waiuu Generating Station, CSP No. 0239-01-C:</u></p> <p>a) Attachment IIA, Section C, Special Condition 3: Exceeded the permit limit of forty percent (40%) opacity or greater during one six (6) minute averaging period on the following date:</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px; border-collapse: collapse; width: 60%;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: center;">Date of Violation</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Opacity</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Unit</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Duration (6-minute Average)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">August 31, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">40%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">6</td> <td style="text-align: center;">19:42 to 19:48</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>2) <u>Kahe Generating Station, CSP No. 0240-01-C:</u></p> <p>a) Attachment IIA, Section C, Special Condition 4.a: Exceeded the permit limit of forty percent (40%) opacity or greater during one six (6) minute averaging period on the following date:</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px; border-collapse: collapse; width: 60%;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: center;">Date of Violation</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Opacity</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Unit</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Duration (6-minute Average)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">July 27, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">43%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-3</td> <td style="text-align: center;">04:00 to 04:06</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>b) Attachment IIA, Section C, Special Condition 4.a: Exceeded the permit limit of sixty percent (60%) opacity for a period aggregating not more than six (6) minutes in any sixty (60) minute period on the following dates:</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px; border-collapse: collapse; width: 60%;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: center;">Date of Violation</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Opacity</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Unit</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Duration (6-minute Average)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">March 30, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">66%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-1</td> <td style="text-align: center;">03:54 to 04:00</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">July 31, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">69%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-4</td> <td style="text-align: center;">22:12 to 22:18</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>c) Attachment IIA, Section C, Special Condition 4.b: Exceeded the permit limit of twenty percent (20%) opacity or greater during one six (6) minute averaging period on the following dates:</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px; border-collapse: collapse; width: 60%;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: center;">Date of Violation</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Opacity</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Unit</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Duration (6-minute Average)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">March 11, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">25%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-6</td> <td style="text-align: center;">18:48 to 18:54</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">June 23, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">20%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-6</td> <td style="text-align: center;">23:54 to 23:59</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">June 24, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">22%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-5</td> <td style="text-align: center;">01:24 to 01:29</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">July 13, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">25%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-5</td> <td style="text-align: center;">17:42 to 17:48</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">August 23, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">20%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-5</td> <td style="text-align: center;">07:42 to 07:48</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>d) Attachment IIA, Section C, Special Condition 4.b: Exceeded the permit limit of sixty percent (60%) opacity for a period aggregating not more than six (6) minutes in any sixty (60) minute period on the following dates:</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px; border-collapse: collapse; width: 60%;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: center;">Date of Violation</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Opacity</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Unit</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Duration (6-minute Average)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">May 28, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">88%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-5</td> <td style="text-align: center;">21:00 to 21:06</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">August 17, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">66%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-5</td> <td style="text-align: center;">00:12 to 00:18</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">September 20, 2016</td> <td style="text-align: center;">91%</td> <td style="text-align: center;">K-6</td> <td style="text-align: center;">18:48 to 18:54</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>e) Attachment IIB, Section D, Special Condition 5.a: Failed to conduct the VE observation for May 2016 by a certified reader in accordance with Method 9 or U.S. EPA approved equivalent method for the Black Start Diesel Engine Generator Unit B.</p>	Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)	August 31, 2016	40%	6	19:42 to 19:48	Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)	July 27, 2016	43%	K-3	04:00 to 04:06	Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)	March 30, 2016	66%	K-1	03:54 to 04:00	July 31, 2016	69%	K-4	22:12 to 22:18	Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)	March 11, 2016	25%	K-6	18:48 to 18:54	June 23, 2016	20%	K-6	23:54 to 23:59	June 24, 2016	22%	K-5	01:24 to 01:29	July 13, 2016	25%	K-5	17:42 to 17:48	August 23, 2016	20%	K-5	07:42 to 07:48	Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)	May 28, 2016	88%	K-5	21:00 to 21:06	August 17, 2016	66%	K-5	00:12 to 00:18	September 20, 2016	91%	K-6	18:48 to 18:54
Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)																																																																		
August 31, 2016	40%	6	19:42 to 19:48																																																																		
Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)																																																																		
July 27, 2016	43%	K-3	04:00 to 04:06																																																																		
Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)																																																																		
March 30, 2016	66%	K-1	03:54 to 04:00																																																																		
July 31, 2016	69%	K-4	22:12 to 22:18																																																																		
Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)																																																																		
March 11, 2016	25%	K-6	18:48 to 18:54																																																																		
June 23, 2016	20%	K-6	23:54 to 23:59																																																																		
June 24, 2016	22%	K-5	01:24 to 01:29																																																																		
July 13, 2016	25%	K-5	17:42 to 17:48																																																																		
August 23, 2016	20%	K-5	07:42 to 07:48																																																																		
Date of Violation	Opacity	Unit	Duration (6-minute Average)																																																																		
May 28, 2016	88%	K-5	21:00 to 21:06																																																																		
August 17, 2016	66%	K-5	00:12 to 00:18																																																																		
September 20, 2016	91%	K-6	18:48 to 18:54																																																																		

The facts of this case and the law justify the following order.

# ORDER

You are ordered to:

1. Take corrective action within twenty (20) days after the receipt of this Order, to prevent further violations, if RESPONDENT has not already done so.
2. Within twenty (20) days after the receipt of this Order, notify the DOH of the corrective actions taken.
3. Pay an administrative penalty of **FORTY-FIVE THOUSAND THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS AND NO CENTS (\$45,300.00)** for the above violations. **Within 20 days after the receipt of the NOVO**, send a certified check to: Clean Air Branch, State Department of Health, P.O. Box 3378, Honolulu, Hawaii 96801. **The check should be made payable to the "State of Hawaii" and include the NOVO reference number stated above.**

This NOVO becomes final and enforceable, and the penalty becomes due and payable 20 days after your receipt of this NOVO unless before the 20 days expire, you submit a **written** request for a hearing to the Hearings Officer, Department of Health, 1250 Punchbowl Street, Third Floor, Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 and to the Clean Air Branch, State Department of Health, P.O. Box 3378, Honolulu, Hawaii 96801. In the request, include a copy of the NOVO. At a hearing, you may seek to avoid any penalty, and the DOH may seek the maximum penalty of Twenty-Five Thousand Dollars (\$25,000) per day, per violation. Parties may present evidence and witnesses on their behalf, and may examine and cross-examine all witnesses and evidence presented by the DOH. Parties may be represented by lawyers at their own expense, or they may represent themselves. Any hearing will follow HRS, Chapters 91 and 342B, and the DOH Rules of Practice and Procedure. After a hearing, the Director of Health or her appointee will decide the actual administrative penalty, which may be more or less than the penalty in this Order, or no penalty at all. If you have questions, please call Ms. Jill Stensrud, Supervisor of the Compliance and Enforcement Section, Clean Air Branch, at (808) 586-4200.

If you have special needs due to a disability that will aid you in participating in the hearing or pre-hearing conference, please contact the Hearings Officer at (808) 586-4409 (voice) or through the Telecommunications Relay Service (711), at least ten (10) working days before the hearing or pre-hearing conference date.



KEITH E. KAWAOKA, D.Env.  
Deputy Director for Environmental Health

OCT 22 2018

Date



Approved as to form by:  
William F. Cooper  
Deputy Attorney General